

2010 Reviewer Rating Form for Oral Papers, Symposia, and Posters

****NOTE: Review carefully as abstract review criteria have been revised.**

- Score abstracts on the following 7 items using the 5 point scale.
- An example of how to operationalize the scale levels (outstanding—unclear or not at all) is provided below, applied to the methodology item. The logic reflected in this example can be generalized across the other evaluation items; for example, the extent to which each item dimension is both clear and also reflects high quality.

5_ To an outstanding degree

4_ To a strong degree

3_ Somewhat or mixed

2_ To a limited degree

1_ Unclear or not at all

- 1. The study adds to the current knowledge base by investigating a question regarding social work practice, policy, theory, or research methodology.
- 2. Relationship of the topic to previous research, theoretical framework, and/or existing literature is clearly described.
- 3. Study objectives, research questions and/or hypotheses are clearly stated.
- 4. Methodology (study design, sampling, data collection, measurement and analysis) is clearly specified and appropriate for study objectives/questions.
- 5. Results are reported for each study objective or research question.
- 6. Conclusions are appropriately stated based on results.
- 7. Implications of findings for social work practice, policy, or further research are clearly stated.

_____ Average Score

Overall Recommendation (please select one of the following)

- Accept – Top priority
- Accept – Medium Priority
- Accept – Low Priority
- Reject

Please include any other information that you feel would be helpful to the program planning committee.

Reviewer comments:

Example of Scale Level Operationalizations: Methodology is Scientifically Sound

“To an outstanding degree” would be used when the sample, method of data collection, research design, and analysis are all appropriate for the research question or problem and represent the best possible choices.

“To a strong degree” indicates that the sample, method of data collection, research design, and analysis are appropriate, but could have been stronger (e.g., you would have recommended a more advanced factor analytic method than the one selected by the author).

“Somewhat or mixed” would be used when the sample, method of data collection, research design, or analysis seem adequate, but are not explicated in sufficient detail to determine their appropriateness, are not as strong as they might have been, or are mixed so that some parts of the study are much weaker than others.

“To a limited degree” indicates that the sample, method of data collection, research design, or analysis have some correspondence to the optimal approach, but are generally very weak.

“Unclear or not at all” would be used when the sample, method of data collection, research design, or analysis are not at all appropriate to the research question or problem, when the four are not congruent with one another (e.g., a sample of caregivers is given a survey to determine the attitudes of patients with diabetes), and/or when the methods were not explicated sufficiently to determine their appropriateness.